SUBJECT:

"Since Ross 1969, discussions of ellipsis in linguistic theory have been framed by two hard questions. First, how much linguistic structure, if any, is there in the ellipsis site? Second, what identity conditions determine how that structure is related to other linguistic material in the discourse?

My aim here is to explore the second of these questions with respect to the ellipsis construction known as sluicing. The hallmark of sluicing is that it has the meaning of a constituent question but the surface form of an interrogative phrase; the rest of the question is "missing."

Consider the English examples in (1), in which the sluice is bracketed and the ellipsis site is underlined. (Throughout, the term sluice refers to the CP dominating the stranded interrogative phrase and the ellipsis site.)

(1) a. Joe says he is investigating someone, but he won't tell me [who__].
    b. She’s complaining, but we don’t know [about what__].
    c. My library card has just been canceled; it’s unclear [why__].

The sluices in (1) have the same interpretations as the corresponding complete constituent questions bracketed in (2).

(2) a. Joe says he is investigating someone, but he won’t tell me [who he is investigating].
    b. She’s complaining, but we don’t know [about what she’s complaining].
    c. My library card has just been canceled; it’s unclear [why it’s just been canceled].

Virtually all investigations of sluicing have accounted for its interpretation by assuming that the ellipsis must be identical, in some sense, to linguistic material elsewhere in the discourse. But exactly what sorts of identity are involved?

Early accounts of sluicing and other types of ellipsis appealed to syntactic identity. Ross (1969) originally proposed that sluicing was derived from a complete constituent question by a deletion transformation. The transformation could apply only when the material to be deleted was syntactically identical to other material in the linguistic context."


Discuss.

Candidates will use relevant excerpts from the following corpus to address the above topic.
| Excerpt 1 | Joe's eyes widened as he asked, 'You... you were thinking about getting married?' 'Yes. Yes.' 'Who to?' The question sounded naive to his ears. 'Marion, Marion Crosbie; you know, the Hallidays' niece; you've met her.' Catherine Cookson, My Beloved Son, 1992 (BNC Corpus) |
| Excerpt 2 | She had reached the head of the line. Her eye caught a name on the list, and she made a snap decision. When the ticket seller said "Where to?" she answered, "Gmintagad." She would go to see where Jemma Diwali had lived — and died. Carolyn Ives Gilman, The Ice Owl, 2011 (COCA Corpus) |
| Excerpt 3 | DANNY —This mentor of yours... was he a good thief in his day? TOULOUR —Who, LeMarc? Danny swallows. DANNY —Yeah. Him. Ocean's Twelve (Screenplay), 2004 (COCA Corpus) |
| Excerpt 4 | He wondered if he dared ask Isobel. She had been widowed for five months, very nearly. Did she go out now and, if so, with whom? He felt a pang of jealousy, which was intensified when he remembered the smart army officers who had been at her husband’s memorial service. Helen Forrester, The Latchkey Kid, 1990 (BNC Corpus) |
| Excerpt 5 | Under the influence of democratic ideologies, on the other hand, this usage may be turned round and then 'popular' can become a legitimating term; this was the case in post-revolutionary America. A different sense — 'well favoured' (but with whom?) — became predominant, at least in Britain, by the late eighteenth century, and in the nineteenth this could shift to 'well liked' (that is, judged good — but by whom?). Milton Keynes Middleton, Studying Popular Music, 1993 (BNC Corpus) |
| Excerpt 6 | Under 16s girls had a draw, I think against NZ Maoris. Under 16s boys had 3 losses and two draws. Open Mens had a win today too, but I'm sorry I don't know who against. http://www.facebook.com/NiueTag/posts/437363259651011 |
| Excerpt 7 | ROS: What are you playing at? GUIL: Words, words. They're all we have to go on. (Pause.) ROS: Shouldn't we be doing something — constructive? GUIL: What did you have in mind?... A short, blunt human pyramid...? ROS: We could go. GUIL: Where? ROS: After him. GUIL: Why? They've got us placed now — if we start moving around, we'll all be chasing each other all night. Tom Stoppard, Rosencrantz and Guildenstern are Dead, 1986 (BNC Corpus) |
| Excerpt 8 | What can you do if the resistance is between 50k and 3k? You can replace the sensor switch. Or, you can try to clean the sensor switch with soap and water and dry off real good. The problem I found with the switch was due to conductive contamination. Don’t know what from. Cleaning helped a little. http://www.isuzupup.com/viewtopic.php?f=36&t=12049&view=previous |
| Excerpt 9 | Sam was enjoying himself. 'Now, my friend. What are you wanting me to do about it?' Sam was way ahead of him. He knew exactly what the chap wanted — and whom. Elmer plucked up enough courage, and went on: 'That lovely girl you're walking-out with... the red-head. I was wondering... has she a friend, or maybe a sister? Gee! what a swell gal she is. I only want someone to go out with me... to the park, or the movies. I'm lonely, Sam.' Jack Caplan, Memories of the Gorbals, 1991 (BNC Corpus) |
| Excerpt 10 | In this essay I have described episodes of when, where, and why my interlocutors articulated or refrained from articulating certain place-names - why some of them retained an original name, why others adopted the designated place-names but in a different language, how others invoked an umbrella name, and why it was only during particular situations that some invoked certain place-names, and in which language. In all the cases cited, I emphasized the importance of stressing the polyglot situation and recognizing the fact that the use of each language in a situated conduct of talk, including but not restricted to place-names, has value and meaning in this sense. Kee Howe Yong, The Politics and Aesthetics of Place-names in Sarawak, 2007 (COCA Corpus) |
Excerpt 11
The obvious starting point was Vic. Mungo sensed that he was either a complete phoney or a principal player in the village drama. There was only one way to find out which. At the first opportunity Mungo would search his cluttered shed for any clues that might be hidden there.

Chris Kelly, *The Forest of the Night*, 1991 (BNC Corpus)

Excerpt 12
'Right, then. We'll see you in five minutes.' 'And what did you make of that?' Lucinda demanded when they were alone. 'A message for one of us but she's not sure which. Peculiar, wouldn't you say?'

Elizabeth Elgin, *All the Sweet Promises*, 1991 (BNC Corpus)

Excerpt 13
His heart pounding, Jean looked at the door. A different woman stood there, a meagre little woman of twenty-eight or nine or even older. His imagination had created it all. How powerful I am, he thought. How powerful! How helpless! 'This way,' said Sarah. 'Where?' 'If I don't have a smoke I'll crack.' 'Isn't that Rose-Marie's garden?' Sarah sniffed, or laughed, it was hard to tell which. She ran down the stairs and opened the glass door, and Catriona followed.

Toni Davidson, *And Thus I will Freely Sing*, 1989 (BNC Corpus)

Excerpt 14
The shower was on down the hall in the bathroom. Bennis was singing something that required her to hit the C above high C, which she couldn't do. This would be something by Joni Mitchell, who was the singer Bennis loved most in the world. All of that meant something, Gregor was sure. He just didn't know what.

Jane Haddam, *Blood in the Water*, 2012 (COCA Corpus)

Excerpt 15
I show her that I'm listening, thinking hard about what she's telling me. Then, letting my worry show, I ask, "How do I respond to certain questions?" She knows which questions. Showing a narrow smile, she asks, "Do you think they're likely to ask them?" "No, I admit."

Robert Reed, *The Majesty of Angels*, 2002 (COCA Corpus)

Excerpt 16
But there were deeper forces at work. The most interesting one to me was the idea held in some of the upper classes that America was somehow soft — "overcivilized," as Theodore Roosevelt put it. We needed a war to regenerate ourselves, and Roosevelt didn't particularly care which war. Did he talk about looking for a war? He wrote about it.

Evan Thomas: *War Lovers and American Power, Military History*, 2010 (COCA Corpus)

Excerpt 17
"Bonsoir," he said. "How may I help you?" The dual-language greeting was the newest hospitality trick of the European host. It presumed nothing and opened the door for the guest to reply in whichever language was more comfortable. Sophie replied with neither. She simply laid the gold key on the counter in front of the man. The man glanced down and immediately stood straighter. "Of course. Your elevator is at the end of the hall. I will alert someone that you are on your way." Sophie nodded and took her key back. "Which floor?" The man gave her an odd look. "Your key instructs the elevator which floor." She smiled. "Ah, yes."


Excerpt 18
Even when she was talking to you or giving you your change, you could feel her smile going somewhere over your shoulder as she took in the whole room behind you. She always knew exactly who was in and who was missing; and if you were missing, Madame probably knew why, and with whom. All night long she made mental notes of all the transactions being made, the profits, the losses, meetings, separations, the wanting, having, getting, seeing, the excess, the moderation, the negotiations [...].

Bartlett, Neil, *Ready to Catch Him Should He Fall*, 1990 (BNC Corpus)

Excerpt 19
The desk guy looked at me again, expectantly, and I said, "I have a twelve o'clock appointment." "Who with?" "Colonel Frazer," I said.